

THE HONORABLE JOHN H. CHUN

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

V.

AMAZON.COM, INC., a corporation,

Defendant.

CASE NO.: 2:23-cv-01495-JHC

**[PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING PLAINTIFFS'
MOTION TO COMPEL
PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS
RELATED TO SPOILATION**

Plaintiffs Federal Trade Commission and the states and territories of New York, Connecticut, New Hampshire, Oklahoma, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, Nevada, New Jersey, New Mexico, Oregon, Puerto Rico, Rhode Island, Vermont, and Wisconsin, acting by and through their respective Attorneys General (“Plaintiff States,” and together with the Federal Trade Commission, “Plaintiffs”) having filed their Motion to Compel Production of Documents Related to Spoliation (the “Motion”), and the Court having considered all papers filed in support and in opposition of the Motion, including all filings and memoranda of law concerning this matter, hereby ORDERS the following:

1. Plaintiffs' Motion is GRANTED.

[PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFFS'
MOTION TO COMPEL PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS
RELATED TO SPOILATION - 1
CASE NO. 23-CV-01495-JHC

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20580
(202) 326-2222

2. Within 30 days of this Order, Amazon shall produce to Plaintiffs:
 - a. All litigation holds, preservation notices, or similar documents sent by Amazon in connection with the June 17, 2019 preservation letters, August 5, 2019 Voluntary Access Letter, February 20, 2020 Civil Investigative Demand, and/or September 26, 2023 Complaint in this matter, as requested by Plaintiffs' Request for Production No. 25.
 - b. All documents relating to instructions or advice given to employees about the use of ephemeral messaging, including but not limited to Signal or Wickr, as requested by Plaintiffs' Request for Production No. 27.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 2024

THE HONORABLE JOHN H. CHUN
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Presented by:

s/ Emily K. Bolles
SUSAN A. MUSSER (DC Bar # 1531486)
EDWARD H. TAKASHIMA (DC Bar # 1001641)
EMILY K. BOLLES (NY Reg. # 5408703)
KARA KING (DC Bar # 90004509)
ERIC ZEPPE (NY Reg. #5538491)
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20580
Tel.: (202) 326-2122 (Musser)
(202) 326-2464 (Takashima)

[PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFFS'
MOTION TO COMPEL PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS
RELATED TO SPOILATION - 2
CASE NO. 23-CV-01495-JHC

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20580
(202) 326-2222

1 Email: smusser@ftc.gov
2 etakashima@ftc.gov
3 ebolles@ftc.gov
4 kking@ftc.gov
5 ezepp@ftc.gov

6 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade
7 Commission*

8 s/ Michael Jo

9 Michael Jo (admitted *pro hac vice*)
10 Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust
11 Bureau
12 New York State Office of the Attorney
13 General
14 28 Liberty Street
15 New York, NY 10005
16 Telephone: (212) 416-6537
17 Email: Michael.Jo@ag.ny.gov
18 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of New York*

19 s/ Rahul A. Darwar

20 Rahul A. Darwar (admitted *pro hac vice*)
21 Assistant Attorney General
22 Office of the Attorney General of
23 Connecticut
24 165 Capitol Avenue
Hartford, CT 06016
Telephone: (860) 808-5030
Email: Rahul.Darwar@ct.gov
Counsel for Plaintiff State of Connecticut

25 s/ Alexandra C. Sosnowski

26 Alexandra C. Sosnowski (admitted *pro hac
27 vice*)
28 Assistant Attorney General
29 Consumer Protection and Antitrust Bureau
30 New Hampshire Department of Justice
31 Office of the Attorney General
32 One Granite Place South
33 Concord, NH 03301
34 Telephone: (603) 271-2678
35 Email: Alexandra.c.sosnowski@doj.nh.gov
36 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of New
37 Hampshire*

38 [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFFS'
39 MOTION TO COMPEL PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS
40 RELATED TO SPOLIATION - 3
41 CASE NO. 23-CV-01495-JHC

42 s/ Caleb J. Smith

43 Caleb J. Smith (admitted *pro hac vice*)
44 Assistant Attorney General
45 Consumer Protection Unit
46 Office of the Oklahoma Attorney General
47 15 West 6th Street, Suite 1000
48 Tulsa, OK 74119
49 Telephone: (918) 581-2230
50 Email: craleb.smith@oag.ok.gov
51 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Oklahoma*

52 s/ Timothy D. Smith

53 Timothy D. Smith, WSBA No. 44583
54 Senior Assistant Attorney General
55 Antitrust and False Claims Unit
56 Oregon Department of Justice
57 100 SW Market St
58 Portland, OR 97201
59 Telephone: (503) 934-4400
60 Email: tim.smith@doj.state.or.us
61 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Oregon*

62 s/ Jennifer A. Thomson

63 Jennifer A. Thomson (admitted *pro hac
64 vice*)
65 Senior Deputy Attorney General
66 Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General
67 Strawberry Square, 14th Floor
68 Harrisburg, PA 17120
69 Telephone: (717) 787-4530
70 Email: jthomson@attorneygeneral.gov
71 *Counsel for Plaintiff Commonwealth of
72 Pennsylvania*

73 **FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION**
74 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
75 Washington, DC 20580
76 (202) 326-2222

1 s/ Michael A. Undorf
2 Michael A. Undorf (admitted *pro hac vice*)
3 Deputy Attorney General
4 Delaware Department of Justice
5 820 N. French St., 5th Floor
6 Wilmington, DE 19801
7 Telephone: (302) 683-8816
8 Email: michael.undorf@delaware.gov
9 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Delaware*

10 s/ Scott A. Mertens
11 Scott A. Mertens (admitted *pro hac vice*)
12 Assistant Attorney General
13 Michigan Department of Attorney General
14 525 West Ottawa Street
15 Lansing, MI 48933
16 Telephone: (517) 335-7622
17 Email: MertensS@michigan.gov
18 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Michigan*

19 s/ Christina M. Moylan
20 Christina M. Moylan (admitted *pro hac*
21 vice)
22 Assistant Attorney General
23 Chief, Consumer Protection Division
24 Office of the Maine Attorney General
6 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04333-0006
Telephone: (207) 626-8800
Email: christina.moylan@maine.gov
Counsel for Plaintiff State of Maine

1 s/ Zach Biesanz
2 Zach Biesanz (admitted *pro hac vice*)
3 Senior Enforcement Counsel
4 Office of the Minnesota Attorney General
5 445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1400
6 Saint Paul, MN 55101
7 Telephone: (651) 757-1257
8 Email: zach.biesanz@ag.state.mn.us
9 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Minnesota*

10 s/ Gary Honick
11 Gary Honick (admitted *pro hac vice*)
12 Assistant Attorney General
13 Deputy Chief, Antitrust Division
14 Office of the Maryland Attorney General
200 St. Paul Place
15 Baltimore, MD 21202
16 Telephone: (410) 576-6474
17 Email: Ghonick@oag.state.md.us
18 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Maryland*

19 s/ Lucas J. Tucker
20 Lucas J. Tucker (admitted *pro hac vice*)
21 Senior Deputy Attorney General
22 Office of the Nevada Attorney General
100 N. Carson St.
Carson City, NV 89701
Telephone: (775) 684-1100
Email: LTucker@ag.nv.gov
23 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Nevada*

24 s/ Michael MacKenzie
Michael MacKenzie (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Deputy Chief, Antitrust Division
Office of the Massachusetts Attorney
General
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
Boston, MA 02108
Telephone: (617) 963-2369
Email: michael.mackenzie@mass.gov
Counsel for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Massachusetts

25 s/ Ana Atta-Alla
Ana Atta-Alla (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Deputy Attorney General
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General
124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor
Newark, NJ 07101
Telephone: (973) 648-3070
Email: Ana.Atta-Alla@law.njoag.gov
26 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of New Jersey*

1 s/ Jeffrey Herrera
2 Jeffrey Herrera (admitted *pro hac vice*)
3 Assistant Attorney General
4 New Mexico Office of the Attorney General
5 408 Galisteo St.
6 Santa Fe, NM 87501
7 Telephone: (505) 490-4878
8 Email: jherrera@nmag.gov
9 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of New Mexico*

10 s/ Gwendolyn J. Cooley
11 Gwendolyn J. Cooley (admitted *pro hac vice*)
12 Assistant Attorney General
13 Wisconsin Department of Justice
14 Post Office Box 7857
15 Madison, WI 53707-7857
16 Telephone: (608) 261-5810
17 Email: cooleygj@doj.state.wi.us
18 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin*

19 s/ Zulma Carrasquillo Almena
20 Zulma Carrasquillo Almena (admitted *pro
hac vice*)
21 Puerto Rico Department of Justice
22 P.O. Box 9020192
23 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00902-0192
24 Telephone: (787) 721-2900, Ext. 1211
Email: zcarrasquillo@justicia.pr.gov
*Counsel for Plaintiff Commonwealth of
Puerto Rico*

25 s/ Stephen N. Provazza
26 Stephen N. Provazza (admitted *pro hac vice*)
27 Special Assistant Attorney General
28 Chief, Consumer and Economic Justice Unit
29 Department of the Attorney General
30 150 South Main Street
31 Providence, RI 02903
32 Telephone: (401) 274-4400
33 Email: sprovazza@riag.ri.gov
34 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island*

35 s/ Sarah L.J. Aceves
36 Sarah L.J. Aceves (admitted *pro hac vice*)
37 Assistant Attorney General
38 Public Protection Division
39 Vermont Attorney General's Office
40 109 State Street
41 Montpelier, VT 05609
42 Telephone: (802) 828-3170
43 Email: Sarah.Aceves@vermont.gov
44 *Counsel for Plaintiff State of Vermont*

45 [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFFS'
46 MOTION TO COMPEL PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS
47 RELATED TO SPOILATION - 5
48 CASE NO. 23-CV-01495-JHC

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20580
(202) 326-2222